

COMMISSION FIFTEENTH REGULAR SESSION

Honolulu, Hawaii, USA 10 – 14 December 2018

REVIEW OF THE WCPFC COMPLIANCE MONITORING SCHEME

CMS IWG Working Draft Text – revision 3

WCPFC15-2018-CMS IWG¹ 30 November 2018

Paper by the Chair of the CMS IWG

-

¹ The Working Draft Text is a revision 3 that is intended to replace the CMS IWG draft text that was issued on 2 October 2018. Revision 3 takes into account the submissions to the CMS IWG from the United States on 16 October 2018 and FFA Members on 17 November 2018 (WCPFC15-2018-DP11_rev1). The list of taskings for CMS-IWG participants as issued on 2 October 2018 is posted as WCPFC-2018-CMSIWG-Homework_rev1

Purpose

1. This paper presents for the consideration of the Commission the CMS IWG Working Draft Text – revision 3.

Background

- 2. A face to face meeting of the Compliance Monitoring Scheme Intersessional Working Group was held on 25 September in Majuro, Republic of the Marshall Island (Meeting of the CMSIWG 25 Sept 2018). The Background Note on the Compliance Monitoring Scheme (WCPFC-2018-CMSIWG-02) reviewed the background to the Review of the Compliance Monitoring Scheme, and the process that the Compliance Monitoring Scheme Intersessional Working Group (CMS IWG) had undertaken in response to its mandate given by WCPFC14. While good progress had been made in the CMS IWG, the Chair of the CMS IWG viewed a face to face meeting as imperative to progress the development of a draft measure for the CMS to a stage that it could be presented to WCPFC15. A face-to-face meeting of the CMS IWG was approved through an intersessional decision and funded through a voluntary contribution from New Zealand. The New Zealand assistance towards the holding of the face to face meeting is greatly appreciated.
- 3. In establishing the CMS IWG at WCPFC14 (2017), the Commission tasked the CMS IWG to facilitate consideration of the report from the Independent Panel on the Review of the Compliance Monitoring Scheme and to develop a proposed conservation and management measure for the Compliance Monitoring Scheme (CMS) for consideration at WCPFC15 (2018). The Final Report from the Independent Panel to review the Compliance Monitoring Schemes is posted as WCPFC15-2018-26. A summary of the views of the CMS IWG on the report from the Independent Panel on the Review of the Compliance Monitoring Scheme is contained in WCPFC15-2018-27A. At its face to face meeting the CMS IWG therefore concentrated on its other task of the development of a proposed CMM on the CMS.
- 4. The FFA presented its proposal on a CMM for the CMS (WCPFC-2018-CMSIWG-03). The face to face meeting agreed to use the FFA proposal as a starting point for the development of a CMS-IWG draft text for presentation and consideration by the Commission at WCPFC15.
- 5. The CMS IWG used a working document (WCPFC-2018-CMSIWG-04_rev1) to facilitate discussion on the draft CMM on the CMS. Following discussion at the face to face meeting, further discussions took place between relevant CMS IWG participants in the spirit of flexibility to develop draft revised text based on a task list (WCPFC-2018-CMSIWG-Homework).
- 6. A further discussion of the CMS IWG took place on 1 October 2018 in the margins of TCC14 and in light of a revised version (revision 1) of the Working Draft Text of a CMM on the CMS as is contained in WCPFC-TCC14-2018-10A. The Working Draft contained in WCPFC-TCC14-2018-10A took into account the discussions in the margins of TCC14 between some CMS IWG participants.
- 7. Provisions where there were divergent views or alternative proposals were in square brackets and the right column of the table contained notes which briefly indicated the status of

the relevant paragraphs. To encourage the document's use as a working document, individual positions of CMS IWG participants were not identified in the document.

8. In light of discussion in the CMS IWG on 1 October 2018, a revised task list was prepared and is contained in WCPFC-2018-CMSIWG-Homework_rev1 (see left side of **Box 1** on next page). The Working Draft (WCPFC-TCC14-2018-10A) was also amended to take into account discussions in the CMS IWG in the margins of TCC14 (WCPFC-TCC14-2018-10A_rev1). It contained draft revisions to the FFA proposal and alternative proposals submitted as a result of the tasking group process (changes in red, with additions shown in underlining and deletions in strikethrough).

TCC14 consideration and recommendation

9. The CMS IWG Chair provided an update on the Working Draft and revised task list to TCC14. In response, TCC14 noted the progress made in the Compliance Monitoring Scheme Intersessional Working Group (TCC14-2018-10A_rev1). TCC14 encouraged further progress to be made in the intersessional period prior to WCPFC15 as a matter of priority, including the tasking list tabled during the CMS IWG face to face meeting held on 25 September and 1 October 2018 in Majuro, Marshall Islands (CMSIWG-2018-Homework_rev1).

(TCC14 draft summary report, para 92)

CMS IWG Working Draft Text – revision 3

- 10. The Working Draft revision 2 that was issued on 2 October 2018 (WCPFC-TCC14-2018-10A_rev1) has been amended to take into account the submissions to the CMS IWG from the United States on 16 October 2018 and FFA Members on 17 November 2018 (WCPFC15-2018-DP11_rev1). It follows the same format as WCPFC-TCC14-2018-10A and earlier revisions.
- 11. Revision 3 contains additional draft revisions to the FFA proposal and alternative proposals submitted as a result of the CMS IWG tasking group process (changes in red, with additions shown in <u>underlining</u> and deletions in <u>strikethrough</u>).
- 12. The Revision 3 Working Draft is intended to be a tool to assist in the development of a CMM on the CMS. It is without prejudice to the individual positions of participants of the CMS IWG or CCMs.
- 13. The Revision 3 Working Draft should be read in conjunction with the written submissions by CMS IWG participants on the FFA proposal and contained on the WCPFC website at https://www.wcpfc.int/cms-iwg. In particular the Working Draft should be considered in light of WCPFC-TCC14-2018-10A_rev1, the United States CMS IWG submission posted on 16 October 2018 and FFA Members on 17 November 2018 (WCPFC15-2018-DP11_rev1).

Homework following TCC14	Notes on CMS IWG
WCPFC-2018-CMSIWG-Homework_rev1	من محامی احما بنج ملا
2 October 2018	their inclusion in revision 3 of
This document builds on WCPFC-2018-CMSIWG-Homework which	Working draft text
was prepared following the face to face meeting on 25 September 2018. The list of tasks set out below are intended to be an	
accompanying document to CMS-IWG Working Draft Text for the	
CMM on CMS -revision 2 (WCPFC-TCC14-2018-10A_rev1) issued on	
2 October 2018.	
It provides tasking following further discussion by CMS IWG in the	
margins of TCC14 and at a face to face meeting on 1 October 2018.	
Preamble: Alternative text from the USA, EU and Japan included in	FFA alternative for
the Working Draft	one preamble
Para 1: To be considered in light of paras 7 and 16.	paragraph included
Para 3: USA, Canada and FFA (alternative text provided; all	
Members to consider)	FFA alternatives provided for para 3,
Para 5: Canada and FFA (all Members to consider)	5, and 6. Note
Para 7: FFA and USA (alternative text provided; all Members to	included for Alt
consider)	1:para7
Para 10: FFA and EU (completed and agreed)	
Para 11: Palau and USA (completed and largely agreed)	
Para 13: FFA and Japan (completed and agreed)	USA alternative
Para 15: FFA and Japan (completed and largely agreed)	provided for para
Para 16: All Members to consider alternative text provided	16bis-16 octies
Para 18: FFA and USA (completed and agreed)	FFA alternative
Para 21: FFA and USA (all Members to consider alternative text	provided for para
provided for paras 7 and 16)	21, and new 8bis-
Para 25: FF∧ and Japan (completed and agreed)	8ter
Para 30: FFA and EU (completed and agreed)	FFA alternative
All Members to consider Paras 1, 2, 6, 27, 28, 31, 32, section VII, 34	
37, 38, 39, 40, annex I	Section VII (32 bis –
USA to provide a working paper on its alternative text proposal for	32 sexies), Section IX (para 37), and
paragraphs 7 and 16 by 15 October 2018.	addition made to

USA, EU and Japan to provide consolidated version of the preamble

by 22 October 2018.

Annex I

Issues for the Commission

- 14. As was agreed at the meeting of CMS IWG on 25th September and 1st October and as contained in WCPFC-2018-CMSIWG-Homework_rev1, further work of the CMS IWG was expected to take place in the intersessional period prior to WCPFC15. A summary of the progress made to date against the tasking list from the CMS IWG meeting is provided in **Box1** above.
- 15. The Commission Chair in her Circular on WCPFC15 Priorities has identified the development of a revised CMM on the CMS through the CMS IWG to be a key issue for WCPFC15. The CMS IWG Chair endeavours to work through the Chair, to obtain timeslots during WCPFC15, to ensure that necessary discussions on the CMM on the CMS may take place as needed.
- 16. Time is of the essence, and noting more work remains to be done, CMS IWG participants are encouraged to continue work prior to WCPFC15 and during to narrow the difference in positions on the Working Draft. If CMS IWG participants have additional alternative texts they should be submitted to the CMS IWG Chair, with cc to the Secretariat.
- 17. The Revision 3 Working Draft which takes into account the intersessional work is now presented to WCPFC15.

CONSERVATION AND MANAGEMENT MEASURE FOR COMPLIANCE MONITORING SCHEME

WORKING DRAFT TEXT – revision 3 (30 November 2018)

Working Draft	Notes
The Commission for the Conservation and Management of Highly Migratory Fish Stocks in the Western and Central Pacific Ocean (the Commission)	
In accordance with the Convention on the Conservation and Management of Highly Migratory Fish Stocks in the Western and Central Pacific Ocean (the Convention):	
Recalling that the Commission has adopted a wide range of conservation and management measures to give effect to the objective of the Convention,	Preamble not discussed Proposed text from the USA, EU and Japan included in this Working Draft
Noting that, in accordance with Article 25 of the Convention, Members of the Commission have undertaken to enforce the provisions of the Convention and any conservation and management measures adopted by the Commission,	
Noting also that, in accordance with international law, Members, Cooperating Non-Members of the Commission and Participating Territories have responsibilities to exercise effective control over their flagged vessels and with respect to their nationals,	
Acknowledging that Article 24 of the Convention obliges Members of the Commission to take the necessary measures to ensure that fishing vessels flying their flag comply with the provisions of the Convention and the conservation and management measures adopted pursuant thereto, as well as the obligations of chartering States with respect to chartered vessels operating as an integral part of their domestic fleets,	
Noting that, in a responsible, open, transparent and non-discriminatory manner, the Commission should be made aware of any and all available information that may be relevant to the work of the Commission in identifying and holding accountable instances of non-compliance by Members, Cooperating Non-Members and Participating Territories with management measures,	
ALT 1 [Recognising the sovereign rights of coastal States, in particular SIDS and territories in the Convention Area, to implement zone-based measures to ensure the sustainable management of fisheries within their Exclusive Economic Zones, and to determine including determining how to implement their	

Working Draft	Notes
WCPFC the obligations of the Commission in their national laws and enforcement of those laws,]	
ALT 2 [Recognising the sovereign rights of coastal States, in particular SIDS and territories in the Convention Area, to implement proper conservation and management zone-based measures within their Exclusive Economic Zones in accordance with international law including UNCLOS to ensure the sustainable management of fisheries within their Exclusive Economic Zones, including determining how to implement the obligations of the Commission in their national laws and enforcement of those laws,]	
ALT 3 [Noting the commitment of FFA members to implement zone-based management within their exclusive economic zones in accordance with international law including UNCLOS to ensure the sustainable management of fisheries, and to determine how to implement their WCPFC obligations in their national laws and enforce those laws,]	Alternative proposal
Committed to Article 30 of the Convention which requires the Commission to give full recognition to the special requirements of developing States, in particular SIDS and territories, [including which may include] the provision of financial, technical and capacity development assistance,	
[Recognising that smaller island developing States have unique needs which require special attention and consideration in the provision of financial, scientific and technological assistance,]	
Committed to the implementation of Conservation and Management Measure 2013-07 to give operational effect to the full recognition of the special requirements of SIDS and territories in the Convention Area, in particular such assistance as may be needed to implement their obligations,	
Further committed to the implementation of Conservation and Management Measure 2013-06 by applying the criteria to determine the nature and extent of the impact of a proposal on SIDS and territories in the Convention Area, in order to ensure that they can meet their obligations, and to ensure that any measure does not result in transferring, directly or indirectly, a disproportionate burden of conservation action onto SIDS and territories,	
Recalling the specific function of TCC under Article 14(1)(b) of the Convention to monitor and review compliance by CCMs with conservation and management measures adopted by the Commission and make such recommendations to the Commission as may be necessary,	

Working Draft	Notes
Recognising the responsibility of Members, Cooperating Non-	
Members and Participating Territories to fully and effectively	
implement the provisions of the Convention and the conservation	
and management measures adopted by the Commission, and the	
need to improve such implementation and ensure compliance	
with these commitments,	
[Recalling the recommendation of the second joint meeting of	
the tuna Regional Fisheries Management Organizations	
(RFMOs) that all RFMOs should introduce a robust compliance	
review mechanism by which the compliance record of each Party	
<u>is examined in depth on a yearly basis,</u>] Cognisant of the MCS and enforcement framework developed by	
the Commission, inter alia the 2010-06 Conservation and	
Management Measure to Establish a List of Vessels Presumed to	
have carried out Illegal, Unreported and Unregulated Fishing	
activities in the WCPO, the online Compliance case file system,	
Article 25 of the Convention, which considers [among others]	
the compliance by individual vessels,	
Adopts the following conservation and management measure in	
accordance with Article 10 of the Convention, establishing the	
WCPFC Compliance Monitoring Scheme:	

Section I – Purpose

Work	king D	raft	Notes
1. [The purpose of the WCPFC Compliance Monitoring Scheme (CMS) is to ensure that Members, Cooperating Non-Members and Participating Territories (CCMs) implement and comply with obligations arising under the Convention and conservation and management measures (CMMs) adopted by the Commission. The purpose of the CMS is not to assess compliance by individual vessels.]		MS) is to ensure that Members, Cooperating Non- id Participating Territories (CCMs) implement and a obligations arising under the Convention and an and management measures (CMMs) adopted by the a. The purpose of the CMS is not to assess	No agreement. Further discussion required on issue of compliance by individual vessels. {linked to paras 7 and 16}
2.	[The (i) (ii)	cCMS is designed to: assess CCMs' compliance with their WCPFC obligations; identify areas in which technical assistance or capacity building may be needed to assist CCMs to attain compliance;	Partial agreement. Revised following tasking group discussions. No agreement on whether to include reference to penalties.
	(iii)	•	Total of the parameters
	(iv)	respond to non-compliance by CCMs through remedial and/or preventative options that include a range of possible responses that take account of the reason for and degree, the severity, consequences	

Working D	raft	Notes
	and frequency of non-compliance, as may be necessary and appropriate to promote compliance with CMMs and other Commission obligations; ² and	
(v)	monitor and resolve outstanding instances of non-compliance by CCMs with their WCPFC obligations.]	

ALT 1

[Section II – Principles]

Working Draft		Notes
	implementation of the CMS and its associated	No agreement.
	ll be conducted in accordance with the following	Further discussion
principles:		required.
(i)	Effectiveness: focus on meeting the purpose of this CMM and these Principles to assess compliance by CCMs;	
(ii)	Efficiency: including avoiding unnecessary administrative burden or costs on CCMs or the Secretariat and removing duplicative reporting obligations; and	
(iii)	Fairness: ensuring that CCMs are:	
	 informed and understand their obligations and associated performance expectations; informed of any potential non-compliance with their obligations; given reasonable time and opportunity to respond to such potential non-compliance; adequately represented; given a fair and unbiased hearing and that any findings are based on evidence; given the right to review any findings made against them. 	
	Collaborative, Quality Improvement and ctive action for CCMs requiring assistance to work ds compliance.]	

_

² In accordance with the process for identifying responses to non-compliance adopted by the Commission to complement the Scheme, as provided for in paragraph 37(iv).

ALT 2

$[\underline{Section~II-\underline{Principles}~Guidelines}]$

Working Draft		Notes
	implementation of the CMS and its associated all be conducted in accordance with the following	Alternative proposal. Further discussion required.
(i)	Effectiveness: focus on Effectively serve meeting the purpose of this CMM and these Principles to assess compliance by CCMs and assist in fulfilling the provisions of Article 25 of the Convention;	
(ii)	Efficiency: including avoiding Avoid unnecessary administrative burden or costs on CCMs or the Secretariat and removing assist in identifying duplicative reporting obligations; and	
(iii)	Promote Ffairness, including by: ensuring that CCMs are:	
	 informed and understand of their obligations and associated performance expectations; informed of any potential non-compliance with their obligations; given reasonable time and opportunity to respond to such potential non-compliance; adequately represented able to participate adequately in the process and state their views; given a fair and unbiased hearing and that any findings are based on evidence engaged in decision-making based on a factual assessment of available information; given the right to review any findings assessments made against them. 	
ensuri capac compi Corre	Promote a supportive, collaborative, and non-sarial approach where possible, with the aim of ing long-term compliance, including considering ity assistance needs or other responses to non-liance. Collaborative, Quality Improvement and ctive action for CCMs requiring assistance to work ds compliance.]	

<u>ALT 3</u>

[Section II – Principles Guidelines]

Working Draft		Notes
	mplementation of the CMS and its associated	Additional alternative
*	Il be conducted in accordance with the following	proposal.
<u>principles to</u> :		
(i)	Effectiveness: Effectively serve the purpose of this CMM to assess compliance by CCMs and assist the TCC in fulfilling the provisions of Article 25-Article 14(1)(b) of the Convention;	
(ii)	Efficiency: Avoid unnecessary administrative burden or costs on CCMs, the Commission or the Secretariat and assist in identifying and removing duplicative reporting obligations; and	
(iii)	Fairness: Promote fairness, including by: ensuring that CCMs are:	
	 informed of their obligations and associated performance expectations; informed of any potential non-compliance with their obligations; given reasonable time and opportunity to respond to such potential non-compliance; able to participate adequately in the process and state their views; engaged in decision-making based on a factual assessment of available information; given the right to review any assessments made. 	
(iv)	Cooperation towards Compliance: Promote a supportive, collaborative, and non-adversarial approach where possible, with the aim of ensuring long-term compliance, including considering capacity assistance needs or other responses to non-compliance quality improvement and corrective action.]	

Section III - Scope and application

Working Dr	aft	Notes
4. The Commission, with the assistance of the Technical and Compliance Committee (TCC) shall evaluate CCMs' compliance with the obligations arising under the Convention and the CMMs adopted by the Commission and identify instances of CCM non-compliance, in accordance with the approach set out in this section.		No comment
rights, jurisdi enforce its na	CMS shall recognise and shall not prejudice the ction and duties of coastal States to adopt and tional laws or to take more stringent measures in with its national laws, consistent with that CCM's obligations.]	No agreement. Tasking group made progress but no agreement reached.
ALT 1:		Alternative proposal
jurisdiction a rights of coast to take more	5. [The CMS shall recognise and shall not prejudice the rights, jurisdiction and duties of <u>all CCMs</u> , including the sovereign <u>rights of</u> coastal States, to adopt and enforce its national laws or to take more stringent measures in accordance with its national laws, consistent with that CCM's international obligations.]	
6. [Each year, the Commission shall consider what obligations shall be assessed in the following year using a risk-based approach. In making this determination, the Commission shall take into account:		No agreement. Further discussion required including on inclusion of risk based
(i)	the needs and priorities of the Commission, including those of its subsidiary bodies;	approach to prioritisation.
(ii)	evidence of high percentages of non-compliance or persistent non-compliance by CCMs with specific obligations for multiple years;	
(iii)	the risks associated with fisheries managed by the Commission that are not monitored independently and for which there is limited data; and	
(iv)	the potential risks posed by non-compliance by CCMs with CMMs (or collective obligations arising from CMMs) to achieve the objectives of the Convention or specific measures adopted thereunder.]	
<u>ALT 1:</u>		Alternative proposal
shall be asses	, the Commission shall consider what obligations sed in the following year using a risk-based making this determination, the Commission shall ount:	

Working Dra	aft	Notes
(i)	the needs and priorities of the Commission, including those of its subsidiary bodies;	
(ii)	evidence of high percentages of non-compliance or persistent non-compliance by CCMs with specific obligations for multiple years;	
(iii)	the risks associated with fisheries managed by the Commission that are not monitored independently and for which there is limited data; and	
(iv)	the potential risks posed by non-compliance by CCMs with CMMs (or collective obligations arising from CMMs) to achieve the objectives of the Convention or specific measures adopted thereunder.]	
of compliance the priority of	Commission shall undertake an annual assessment by CCMs during the previous calendar year with oligations identified under paragraph 6. Such hall be determined based on two criteria:	No agreement. Further discussion required on the criteria
(i)	Implementation – where an obligation applies, the CCM is required to provide evidence that it has adopted, in accordance with its own national policies and procedures, binding measures that implement that obligation; and	on which to base assessments.
(ii)	Follow through on Compliance Outcomes – the CCM is required to provide evidence that it has a system or procedures to monitor compliance of vessels with these binding measures and to respond to non-compliance.]	
ALT 1: 7. [The Commission shall undertake an annual assessment of compliance by CCMs during the previous calendar year with the priority obligations identified under paragraph 6. Such assessment shall be determined based on two the following criteria:		Alternative proposal. Further discussion required on the criteria on which to base assessments.
(i)	For a CCM-level quantitative limit or collective CCM quantitative limit, such as a limit on fishing capacity, fishing effort, or catch, verifiable data indicating that the limit has not been exceeded.	Some support for (i)
(ii)	For other obligations: a. Implementation – where an obligation applies, the CCM is required to provide [evidence] [information showing] that it has adopted, in accordance with its own national policies and procedures, binding measures that implement that obligation; and	

Working Draft		Notes
b.	Follow through on Compliance Outcomes Monitor and ensure compliance – the CCM is required to provide evidence information showing that it has a system or procedures to monitor compliance of vessels and persons with these binding measures, a system or procedures and to respond to instances of non-compliance and has taken action in the event of potential non-compliance to investigate and respond to any non-compliance.]	
8. The preparation, distribution and discussion of compliance information pursuant to the CMS shall be in accordance with all relevant rules and procedures relating to the protection and dissemination of, and access to, public and non-public domain data and information compiled by the Commission. In this regard, Draft and Provisional Compliance Monitoring Reports shall constitute non-public domain data, and the Final Compliance Monitoring Report shall constitute public domain data.		No comment.

<u>ALT</u>

Working Draft	Notes
[WCPFC Online Compliance Case file system	Alternative proposal to
	add reference to online
8 bis. The Secretariat shall maintain the WCPFC online	compliance case file
compliance case file system as a secure, searchable system to	system.
store, manage and make available information to assist CCMs	
with tracking alleged violations by their flagged vessels.	Some conforming edits
	to paragraph 8 may also
8 ter. A flag CCM shall provide updates into the online system	be needed to reflect that
on the progress of investigation until its conclusion.	the online compliance
	case file system
8 quater. CCMs that are relevant to a case shall be allowed to	contains non-public
view those cases for vessels flying other flags. Relevant CCMs	domain data.
shall comprise the CCM that notified the case to the flag CCM,	
and where applicable, the coastal CCM, the ROP observer	
provider and the chartering CCM.]	
	1

<u>Section IV – Special Requirements of Developing States</u>

Working D	raft	Notes
Participating meet a parti of capacity ³	vithstanding paragraph 4, where a SIDS or g Territory, or Indonesia or the Philippines cannot cular obligation that is being assessed, due to a lack, that CCM shall provide a Capacity Development Secretariat with their draft Compliance Monitoring MR), that:	No comment.
(i)	clearly identifies and explains what is preventing that CCM from meeting that obligation;	
(ii)	identifies the capacity assistance needed to allow that CCM to meet that obligation;	
(iii)	estimates the costs and/or technical resources associated with such assistance, including, if possible, funding and technical assistance sources where necessary;	
(iv)	sets out an anticipated timeframe in which, if the identified assistance needs are provided, that CCM will be able to meet that obligation.	
the Capacity	CCM may work together with the Secretariat to draft Development Plan. This plan shall be attached to comments to the dCMR.	No comment. Issue resolved following tasking group discussion.
through the dCMR by a Philippines, particular of elements of paragraph 9 "Capacity A recommend Developments	re a capacity assistance need has been identified, preparation of a Capacity Development Plan, in a SIDS, Participating Territory, Indonesia or the which has prevented that CCM from fulfilling a bligation, and TCC has confirmed that all of the the Capacity Development Plan as stated in are included, TCC shall assess that CCM as assistance Needed" for that obligation. TCC shall to the Commission that it allow the Capacity and assistance delivery set out therein.	Largely agreed. Revised following tasking group discussion.
Development CCM shall n	CCM shall report its progress under the Capacity at Plan every year in its Annual Report Part II. That remain assessed as "Capacity Assistance Needed" particular obligation until the end of the timeframe in	No comment.
Developmen	re the Commission is identified in the Capacity at Plan to assist that CCM, the Secretariat shall annual report of such assistance to TCC.	No comment. Issue resolved following tasking group discussion.

_

 $^{^3}$ Any CCM may identify a capacity assistance need through the CMS process; however, the application of paragraphs 9-11 is limited to those CCMs identified in the paragraph.

Working Draft	Notes
14. If a CCM notifies the Commission that its capacity needs have been met, the Capacity Development Plan for that obligation shall be deemed completed and the CCM's compliance with that obligation shall then be assessed in accordance with Annex I.	No comment.
15. Unless the SIDS, Participating Territory, Indonesia or Philippines amends the Capacity Development Plan that it submitted under paragraph 11 in its dCMR and TCC has confirmed that all the elements of that Plan as stated in paragraph 9 are included, once the timeframe in that original Plan has passed, that CCM's compliance with that obligation shall be assessed in accordance with Annex I.	Largely agreed. Revised following tasking group discussions.
16. The Commission recognises the special requirements of developing State CCMs, particularly SIDS and Participating Territories, and shall seek to actively engage and cooperate with these CCMs and facilitate their effective participation in the implementation of the CMS including by:	No comment.
(i) ensuring that inter-governmental sub-regional agencies which provide advice and assistance to these CCMs, are able to participate in the processes established under the CMS, including by attending any working groups as observers and participating in accordance with Rule 36 of the Commission's Rules of Procedure, and having access to all relevant information, and	
(ii) providing appropriately targeted assistance to improve implementation of, and compliance with, obligations arising under the Convention and CMMs adopted by the Commission, including through consideration of the options for capacity building and technical assistance.	

<u>ALT</u>

Working Draft	Notes
ALT 1: [Investigation Status Report	No agreement.
	Alternative and
16 bis. Where a CCM cannot complete an investigation into an	additional proposal to
alleged violation prior to TCC, that CCM shall provide an	reintroduce flag state
Investigation Status Report (ISR) to the Secretariat with the	investigation.
dCMR, that provides the following information:	Tasking group is also
(i) whether an investigation has been commenced;	considering a somewhat
(ii) the process that CCM will take to complete the	different, compromise
investigation, within its relevant national processes and	approach whereby
<u>laws;</u>	CCMs would be
(iii) an anticipated timeframe to complete the	assessed separately
investigation.	based on
	implementation of

Working Draft Notes 16 ter. The CCM may work together with the Secretariat to draft obligations and their the ISR. This report shall be attached to that CCM's comments to response as flag CCMs the dCMR. to alleged violations by their vessels of those 16 quater. Where an investigation has been notified as ongoing, obligations. Alternative through the preparation of an ISR, and TCC has confirmed that text can be provided for all of the elements of the ISR as stated in paragraph [X] are this suggestion. included, TCC shall assess that CCM as "Flag State Investigation" for that obligation. 16 quinquies. When an investigation is complete, that CCM shall provide a report of the outcome of the investigation in its Annual Report Part II that shall include the information listed below, and based on that information, the TCC shall determine whether the status should be changed to Flag State Investigation Completed: (i) Whether a violation was found to have occurred; If enforcement action was taken – what was that action, including the amount of any penalty or permit sanction, as applicable; (iii) If no enforcement action was taken – a brief statement providing the reason(s). 16 sexies. Where an investigation has been ongoing for two years, that CCM shall report to TCC annually on the status of the investigation and steps it has taken to progress the investigation, and based on that report, the TCC may reconsider the CCM's assessment status.] **ALT 2:** [Investigation Status Report Alternative version of proposal to reintroduce 16 bis. Where there are alleged violations identified in a CCM's flag state investigation. dCMR, that CCM shall provide an Investigation Status Report (ISR) for each alleged violation to the Secretariat with the dCMR {Some conforming that provides the following information: edits and introductory language may also be (a) Has an investigation been started? (Yes/No) needed.} (b) If yes, what is the current status of the investigation? (Ongoing, Completed) (c) If the alleged violations stem from an observer report, have you obtained the observer report? (Yes/No) (d) If no, what steps have you taken to obtain the observer report? (e) What was the outcome of the investigation? (Closed – no violation; Infraction – not charged; Infraction – charged) (f) If no violation, provide brief explanation

Working Draft	Notes
(g) If infraction, but not charged, provide brief	
<u>explanation</u>	
(h) If infraction charged, how was it charged (e.g.,	
penalty/fine, permit sanction, verbal or written warning,	
etc.) and level of charged (e.g., penalty amount, length of sanction, etc.)	
16 ter. The CCM may work together with the Secretariat to draft	
the ISR. This report shall be attached to that CCM's comments to	
the dCMR.	
16 quater. Where an investigation has been notified as ongoing,	
through the preparation of an ISR, and all of the elements of the	
ISR as stated in paragraph 16bis are included, TCC shall assess	
that CCM as "Flag State Investigation" for that investigation.	
16 quinquies. Where an investigation has been notified as	
completed, through the preparation of an ISR, and all the elements of the ISR as stated in paragraph 16bis are included,	
TCC shall assess that CCM as "Compliant" [or "Completed"?]	
for that investigation.	
16 sexies. When an investigation has not been started or all	
elements of the ISR as stated in paragraph 16bis have not been	
included, TCC shall assess that CCM as "Non-Compliant" for	
that investigation.	
16 septies. The assessments in paragraphs 16quater – 16sexies	
will be taken without discussion unless a CCM has a specific	
concern or if there are updates from the Secretariat based on new information received.	
16 octies. Where an investigation has been ongoing for two	
years, that CCM shall report to TCC annually on the status of the	
investigation and steps it has taken to progress the investigation,	
and based on that report, the TCC may reconsider the CCM's	
assessment status.]	

Section V – Prior to TCC

Notes
No comment.

Working Draft	Notes
18. Each dCMR shall reflect information relating to the relevant CCM's implementation of obligations as identified under paragraph 6 as well as any potential compliance issues, where appropriate. Such information shall be sourced from reports submitted by CCMs as required in CMMs and other Commission obligations, such as:	Agreement. Revised following tasking group discussions.
i information available to the Commission through data collection programmes, including but not limited to, high seas transshipment reports, Regional Observer Programme data and information, Vessel Monitoring System information, High Seas Boarding and Inspection Scheme reports, and charter notifications;	
ii information contained in an Annual Report which is not available through other means; and	
iii where appropriate, any additional suitably documented information regarding compliance during the previous calendar year.	
19. The Draft Report shall present all available information relating to each CCM's implementation of obligations for compliance review by TCC.	No comment.
20. At least 55 days prior to TCC each year, the Executive Director shall transmit to each CCM its dCMR.	No comment.
21. [At the same time, the Executive Director shall transmit to all CCMs a separate document containing aggregated vessel level data across all fleets, drawn from the online compliance case file system, to provide an indicator of potential anomalies in the implementation of the Convention and the CMMs by a CCM, with a view towards identifying implementation challenges. This document shall constitute Non-Public domain data. The presence of potential vessel infringements in such aggregated data shall not be used to influence the compliance assessment of the CCM.]	No agreement. Further discussion required in light of alternative para 7 and 16 language.
ALT 1: 21. [At the same time, the Executive Director shall draw from the online case file system and transmit to: (i) each flag CCM, the infringement identification relating to alleged violations by its flagged vessels for that CCM's own use to commence or progress an investigation on the online system. Relevant CCMs shall also be provided this same information; and (ii) all CCMs, aggregated vessel level information across all fleets. This will be used to provide an indicator	Alternative proposal that refers to online compliance case file system and trial summary tables of flag CCM responses to alleged infringements that were prepared by the Secretariat in 2018 (ii).
of potential anomalies in the implementation of obligations by a CCM, with a view towards identifying	{For (i) the Secretariat confirms each CCM

Working Draft	Notes
challenges for that CCM and providing targeted assistance. This information shall be considered by TCC alongside the Draft Compliance Monitoring Report.]	can export the relevant cases from online system, using a new "print view"}
22. Upon receipt of its dCMR, each CCM may, where appropriate, reply to the Executive Director no later than 28 days prior to TCC each year to:	No comment.
(i) provide additional information, clarifications, amendments or corrections to information contained in its dCMR;	
(ii) identify any particular difficulties with respect to implementation of any obligations; or	
(iii) identify technical assistance or capacity building needed to assist the CCM with implementation of any obligations.	
23. Relevant CCMs may continue to provide additional information or clarification into the online compliance case file system. Where such additional information or clarification is provided, at least fifteen days in advance of the TCC meeting, the Executive Director shall circulate an updated version of the document referred to under paragraph 21.	No comment.
24. To facilitate meeting obligations under paragraphs 22 and 23, active cooperation and communication between a flag CCM and other relevant CCMs is encouraged.	No comment.
25. At least fifteen days in advance of the TCC meeting, the Executive Director shall compile and circulate to all CCMs the full Draft Report that will include any potential compliance issues and requirements for further information to assess the relevant CCM's compliance status, in a form to be agreed to by the Commission, including all information that may be provided under paragraph 23.	Agreement. Revised following tasking group discussions. Cross-reference corrected.
26. TCC shall review the Draft Report and identify any potential compliance issues for each CCM, based on information contained in the dCMRs, as well as any information provided by CCMs in accordance with paragraph 22 of this measure. CCMs may also provide additional information to TCC with respect to implementation of its obligations.	No comment.

<u>Section VI – Development of the Provisional Compliance Monitoring Report at TCC</u>

Working Draft	Notes
27. Taking into account any Capacity Development Plans developed pursuant to paragraphs 9 – 11, any additional information provided by CCMs, and, where appropriate, any additional information provided by non-government organisations or other organisations concerned with matters relevant to the implementation of this Convention, TCC shall develop a Provisional Compliance Monitoring Report (the Provisional Report) that includes a compliance status with respect to all applicable individual obligations as well as recommendations for any corrective action(s) needed by the CCM or action(s) to be taken by the Commission, based on potential compliance issues it has identified in respect of that CCM and using the criteria and considerations for assessing Compliance Status set out in Annex I of this measure.	No comment. {Note cross reference.}
28. A provisional assessment of each CCM's Compliance Status shall be decided by consensus. If every effort to achieve consensus regarding a particular CCM's compliance with an individual obligation has failed, the provisional CMR shall indicate the majority and minority views. A provisional assessment shall reflect the majority view and the minority view shall also be recorded.	Agreement. Revised following tasking group discussions to place previous para 28 before other paragraphs and make consequential changes.
29. Notwithstanding paragraph 28 above, a CCM shall not block its own compliance assessment if all other CCMs present have concurred with the assessment. If the assessed CCM disagrees with the assessment, its view shall be reflected in the Provisional or Final CMR. [Such CCM may also invoke the process set out in Section VII.]	Partial agreement. Further discussion required on final sentence and Section VII.
30. Where a CCM has missed a reporting deadline, ⁴ but has submitted the required information, this obligation will be accepted by TCC, unless a CCM has a specific concern or if there are updates from the Secretariat based on new information received.	No comment.
31. [The Provisional Report shall also comprise an executive summary including recommendations or observations from TCC regarding: (i) identification of any CMMs or obligations that should be reviewed to address implementation or compliance difficulties experienced by CCMs, particularly when TCC has identified ambiguity in the interpretation of or difficulty in monitoring and implementing that measure or obligation,	No agreement. Further discussion required including on risk based assessment.

_

⁴ For the purposes of the Compliance Monitoring Scheme, all reporting deadlines will be based on Universal Time Code (UTC) time unless the CMM establishing the deadline specifies otherwise.

Working Draft	Notes
including any specific amendments or improvements that have been identified,	
(ii) capacity building assistance or other obstacles to implementation identified by CCMs, in particular SIDS and Participating Territories,	
(iii) risk-based assessment of priority obligations to be assessed in the subsequent year.]	
32. [The Provisional Report shall be finalised at TCC and	No agreement.
forwarded to the Commission for consideration at the annual	Further discussion
meeting.]	required regarding
	whether information is
	to be provided between
	TCC and Commission.
	{Note link to paras 33
	and 34.}

Section VII – Process after TCC

[This is taken from the Independent Review Panel's Final Report and whilst FFA Members agree to the concept, we will need to further consider the details.

Working Draft	Notes
Where a CCM is of the view that the TCC process has operated	No agreement.
in a manner that has been procedurally unfair for it, or that it has	Further discussion
produced an outcome that is unfair for it, that CCM may request	required on any appeal
an informal review of the process or outcome or both. The	mechanism and its
request shall be communicated to the Executive Director in	details.
writing not later than 30 days after the conclusion of the TCC in	
question.	
The review will be conducted by the Chair of the Commission	
between the TCC in which the matter arose and the next	
Commission annual session. The Chair of the Commission will	
be assisted by the Vice-Chair and, if the CCM so requests, by	
two other CCMs one from FFA members and one from other	
States, who shall be selected by the Chair after consultation with	
those groups.	
The review will normally be conducted by way of a written	
submission by the CCM, or by any individual or organization	
acting on behalf of the CCM. The Chair will also seek a report	
on the matter from the Chair of the TCC.	
If the CCM requests, the CCM will also be given the opportunity	
to make oral submissions, which may also be made by any	
individual or organization acting on its behalf.	
The Descriptional Council and Manifestine Description 11 Council and Manifestine 11 Council a	
The Provisional Compliance Monitoring Report will refer to the	
request for a review, and will not make any finding as regards	

Working Draft	Notes
compliance or non-compliance with respect to the matter in	
question, pending the review.	
The outcome of the review will be decided by a majority of those	
conducting the Review, with the Chair having a deciding vote if	
necessary. The outcome will be communicated to the meeting of	
the Commission following the TCC in question. The	
Commission will take the outcome into account in adopting the	
final Compliance Monitoring Report including its decision	
regarding compliance or non-compliance with respect to the	
matter in question.]	
-	

[ALT: Section VII – Process after TCC

Working Draft	Notes
32 bis. Where a CCM is of the view that its compliance assessment for a specific obligation at TCC was undertaken in a manner that has been procedurally unfair, that CCM may request a review of the process.	Alternative proposal for review process post-TCC
32 ter. The request for a review shall be communicated to the Executive Director as a written submission not later than 7 days after the conclusion of the relevant TCC meeting. The Executive Director shall promptly forward the request to the reviewers.	
32 quater. The reviewers shall comprise the Chair of the Commission, the Vice-Chair and the Legal Advisor. The review shall be completed within 14 days after the reviewers' receipt of the requests ("review period"). The Commission Chair shall also seek a report on the matter from the TCC Chair.	
32 quinquies. If the CCM requests, the CCM shall also be given the opportunity to make oral submissions. Such oral submissions shall be made not later than 7 days after the commencement of the review period. Any related costs shall be borne by that CCM.	
32 sexies. The outcome of the review shall be decided by a majority of the reviewers. If the reviewers find that TCC followed the process, a recommendation shall be made to the Commission to maintain TCC's recommendation. If the reviewers find that the process was not followed, the matter shall be suspended and returned to TCC for further consideration. The outcome of the review shall be communicated to the next annual session of the Commission. The Commission shall take the outcome into account in adopting the final Compliance Monitoring Report.]	

Section VIII – Process at the Commission

Working Draft	Notes
33. At each annual Commission meeting, the Commission shall consider the Provisional Report recommended by the TCC.	No comment.
34. [Taking into account any reviews undertaken after TCC under Section VII,] the Commission shall adopt a final Compliance Monitoring Report.	No agreement. Further discussion required on Section VII.
35. The final Compliance Monitoring Report shall include a Compliance Status for each CCM against each assessed obligation and any corrective action needed, and also contain an executive summary setting out any recommendations or observations from the Commission regarding the issues listed in paragraph 31 of this measure.	No comment.
36. Each CCM shall include, in its Part II Annual Report, any actions it has taken to address non-compliance identified in the Compliance Monitoring Report from previous years.	No comment.

Section IX – Future Work

Decidi III I utule 11 din	
Working Draft	Notes
37. [The Commission hereby establishes an intersessional working group to develop a multi-year workplan with tasks to enhance the CMS, with the aim of making it more efficient and effective by streamlining processes. This workplan shall include <i>inter alia</i> :	No agreement. Further discussion required, including on details of the work plan and its placement.
(i) a comprehensive review of all the Commission's reporting requirements, with recommendations to remove duplicative reporting as well as ensure the Commission's data and information needs are met;	
(ii) the development of audit points to clarify the Commission obligations assessed under the CMS, as well as the development of a checklist to be used by the proponents of any proposal to include a list of potential audit points for the consideration of the Commission;	
(iii) the development of a risk-based assessment framework to inform compliance assessments and ensure obligations are meeting the objectives of the Commission;	
(iv) the development of corrective actions to encourage and incentivise CCMs' compliance with the Commission's obligations, where non-compliance is identified. This may include the revision of existing	

Working Draft	Notes
measures and building these actions into future measures; and	
(v) any other tasks as required by the Commission.]	
<u>ALT 1:</u>	Alternative draft
37. [The Commission hereby [establishes an intersessional working group] commits to [develop] a multi-year workplan of [with] tasks to enhance the CMS, with the aim of making it more efficient and effective by streamlining processes. This workplan shall include <i>inter alia</i> :	Further discussion required, including on details of the work plan and its placement.
<u>During 2019</u>	
(i) a comprehensive review of all the Commission's reporting requirements, with recommendations to remove duplicative reporting as well as ensure the Commission's data and information needs are met;	{Note WCPFC15- 2018-DP11_rev1 contains in Attachment 2 proposed terms of reference for items (i),
(ii) the development of audit points to clarify the Commission obligations assessed under the CMS, as well as the development of a checklist to be used by the proponents of any proposal to include a list of potential audit points for the consideration of the Commission;	(ii) and (iii). Item (i) is tasked to the Secretariat, item (ii) and (iii) are tasked to be completed through
<u>During 2019 - 2020</u>	consultancy}.
(iii) the development of a risk-based assessment framework to inform compliance assessments and ensure obligations are meeting the objectives of the Commission;	
From 2020 onwards	
(iv) the development of corrective actions to encourage and incentivise CCMs' compliance with the Commission's obligations, where non-compliance is identified. This may include the revision of existing measures and building these actions into future measures;	
(v) the development of the guidelines for participation of observers in closed meetings of the Commission and its subsidiary bodies which consider the Compliance Monitoring Report; and	
(vi) any other tasks as required by the Commission.]	
38. [The Commission shall develop overarching guidelines for the CMS, including operating procedures and systems to guide the work of the Secretariat, consistent with the Principles in this measure. TCC shall consider any workplan and resourcing requirements to facilitate the work of the Secretariat in this regard.]	No agreement. Further discussion required. {Note link to para 3}.

$\underline{Section~X-Application~and~review}$

Wor	king Draft	Notes
39.	[This measure shall be reviewed in 2019.]	No agreement. Further discussion required on term of measure and review period.
40.	[This measure will be effective for 2019 only.]	No agreement. Further discussion required on term of measure and review period.

[Annex I - Compliance Status Table

FFA Members recognise the future work required to develop audit points (as set out above in future work). Further consideration will be needed on the criteria for the transitional period in 2019.

Working Draf	t	Notes		
Compliance	[Criteria in	Criteria	Response	No agreement.
Status ⁵	<u>2019]</u>	[once the		Further discussion
	[Interim	audit points		required.
	<u>criteria]</u>	<u>are</u>		{Note link to draft text}
		developed]		
Compliant	A CCM will be	Compliance	None	New Column "Criteria
	deemed	with the audit		in 2019" is intended to
	Compliant	points		recognise that future
	with an			work is required to
	obligation if			develop audit points,
	the following			and interim criteria will
	criteria have all			be needed.
	been met:			
	a. reporting or			
	submission			
	deadlines;			
	deadiffies,			
	<u>b.</u>			
	<u>implementation</u>			
	of obligations			
	<u>through</u>			
	national laws			
	or regulations;			
	c. submission			
	of all			
	mandatory			
	information or			
	data required,			
	in the agreed			
	format, as			
	applicable.			
Non-	A CCM will be	Failure to	Each CCM	
Compliant	deemed Non-	meet the	shall include,	
	Compliant	audit points	in its Part II	
	with an		Annual	
	obligation if		Report, any	
	any of the		actions it has	
	following have		taken to	

-

⁵ This annex applies to compliance statuses assigned for each individual obligation.

	Working Draft				
occurred, as	address non-				
applicable:	-				
occurred, as applicable: a. a CCM has failed to comply with an obligation not specifically identified as Priority Non- Compliant; b. information or data for the obligation has been submitted or reported in a way that is incomplete, incorrect, or wrongly formatted; or c. a CCM has failed to meet reporting or submission deadlines.	address non- compliance identified in the Compliance Monitoring Report. Actions may include, one or more of the following: a. A CCM must address the issue to gain compliance by the next compliance assessment; or b. A CCM shall provide a Status Report to the Secretariat; or c. Other response as determined by				
submission	c. Other response as				

Working Draf	`t			Notes
Priority	A CCM will be	a. non-	Each CCM	
Non-	deemed	compliance	shall include,	
Compliant	Priority Non-	with high-risk	in its Part II	
<i></i>	Compliant	priority	Annual	
	with an	obligations	Report, any	
	obligation if	and	actions it has	
	any of the	associated	taken to	
	following have	audit points	address non-	
	occurred, as	1	compliance	
	applicable:	b. repeated non-	identified in	
	a. exceeded	compliance	the	
	quantitative	with an	Compliance	
	<u>limit</u>	obligation for	Monitoring	
	established by	two or more	Report.	
	<u>the</u>	consecutively	Actions may include, one	
	Commission;	assessed	or more of	
	b. failure to	years; or	the following:	
	submit its Part	c. any other	a. A CCM	
	2 Annual	non-	must address	
	Report;	compliance	the issue to	
	-	identified as	gain	
	c. repeated	Priority Non-	compliance	
	non-	Compliant by	by the next	
	compliance	the	compliance	
	with an	Commission.	assessment;	
	obligation for		· ·	
	two or more		b. Other	
	consecutively		response as	
	assessed years;		determined by	
	<u>or</u>		the	
	d. any other		Commission.	
	non-			
	<u>compliance</u>			
	identified as			
	Priority Non-			
	Compliance by			
	<u>the</u>			
	Commission.			
Capacity	A SIDS or	When a SIDS	(i) The CCM	
Assistance	Participating	or	shall complete	
Needed	Territory or	Participating	the steps of	
	Indonesia or	Territory or	the Capacity	
	the Philippines	Indonesia or	Development	
	will be deemed	the	Plan for that	

Capacity Assistance Needed where they cannot meet an obligation in order to become compliant with the obligation, and the following have occurred: a. that CCM has provided a Capcity Development Plan to the Secretariat with its dCMR prior to TCC: and b. TCC confirms that all the elements of paragraph 9 are included in that Plan. CMM CMM Philippines cannot meet an obligation in order to become compliant with the obligation, and (ii) report progress against that plan every year in its Annual Report Part II until the end of the timeframe specified in that Plan. CMM There is a lack Review Philippines cannot meet an obligation in order to become compliant with the obligation, and (ii) report progress against that plan every year in its Annual Report Part II until the end of the timeframe specified in that Plan.	Working Draf	Notes			
		Capacity Assistance Needed where they cannot meet an obligation and the following have occurred: a. that CCM has provided a Capcity Development Plan to the Secretariat with its dCMR prior to TCC; and b. TCC confirms that all the elements of paragraph 9 are included in	cannot meet an obligation that is being assessed due to a lack of capacity, that CCM shall provide a Capacity Development Plan to the Secretariat with the dCMR prior	order to become compliant with the obligation, and (ii) report progress against that plan every year in its Annual Report Part II until the end of the timeframe specified in	
the clarity on the requirements of an obligation. collinaries of an obligation. collinaries of an obligation. collinaries of an obligation. collinaries of an and clarify its requirements.]	CMM Review	of clarity on the requirements of an	lack of clarity on the requirements of an	Commission shall review that obligation and clarify its	