



ELEVENTH REGULAR SESSION
Faleata Sports Complex, Apia, SAMOA
1 - 5 December 2014

**Comments of Japan and Indonesia on FFA Members Proposal for a CMM to Develop and
Implement a Harvest Strategy Approach for Key Fisheries in the WCPO**

WCPFC11-2014 – DP24

December 2014

1650

Submitted by Indonesia and Japan

Refer paper (WCPFC11-2014-DP09_REV1)

Comments of Japan and Indonesia on FFA MEMBER CCMS PROPOSAL FOR A CONSERVATION AND MANAGEMENT MEASURE TO DEVELOP AND IMPLEMENT A HARVEST STRATEGY APPROACH FOR KEY FISHERIES IN THE WCPO – REV 1 (WCPFC11-2014-DP09_rev1)

CONSERVATION AND MANAGEMENT MEASURE ON ESTABLISHING A HARVEST STRATEGY FOR KEY STOCKS-SPECIFIC FISHERIES IN THE WESTERN AND CENTRAL PACIFIC OCEAN

Conservation and Management Measure 2014-xx

The Western and Central Pacific Fisheries Commission (WCPFC):

Noting that the objective of the *Convention on the Conservation and Management of Highly Migratory Fish Stocks in the Western and Central Pacific Ocean* (the Convention) is to ensure through effective management, the long-term conservation and sustainable use of the highly migratory fish stocks of the Western and Central Pacific Ocean in accordance with the *United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea* (the 1982 Convention) and the *Agreement for the Implementation of the Provisions of the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea of 10 December 1982 relating to the Conservation and Management of Straddling Fish Stocks and Highly Migratory Fish Stocks* (the UN Fish Stocks Agreement);

Recalling Article 6 (3) of the UN Fish Stocks Agreement and Article 6 of the Convention, which call for the establishment of precautionary stock-specific reference points to implement the precautionary approach, as well as action to be taken if such points are exceeded;

Further recalling that Article 6(1)(a) of the Convention provides that the guidelines set out in Annex II of the UN Fish Stocks Agreement form an integral part of the Convention and shall be applied by the Commission. These guidelines provide guidance on the application of precautionary reference points in the conservation and management of straddling fish stocks and highly migratory fish stocks, including the adoption of provisional reference points when information for establishing reference points is absent or poor;

Noting that Article 7.5.3 of the FAO *Code of Conduct for Responsible Fisheries* also recommends the implementation of stock specific target and limit reference points, inter alia, on the basis of the precautionary approach;

Concerned that fishing mortality for a number of tuna stocks in the Western and Central Pacific Ocean is in excess of the range of maximum sustainable yield levels and that these stocks are not being managed sustainably;

Recalling the recommendations from the Performance Review of the WCPFC on the Precautionary Approach and Limit Reference Points, which the Commission considers to be a high priority;

Adopts, in accordance with Article 10 of the Convention, the following conservation and management measure with respect to establishing harvest strategies for key stocks fisheries in the Western and Central Pacific Ocean:

Objective of this measure

1. To agree that the Commission shall develop and implement a harvest strategy approach for each of the key-stocks-specific fisheries under the purview of the Commission, ~~with an initial focus on harvest strategies for key target fisheries,~~ according to the process and indicative schedule set out in this conservation and management measure (CMM).

General provisions

2. A harvest strategy is a framework that specifies the pre-determined management actions in a ~~fishery for~~ defined species (at the stock or management unit level) necessary to achieve agreed biological, economic and/or social management objectives.
3. ~~The Commission agrees that harvest strategies established pursuant to this CMM may be developed for~~ Aa fishery that targets or catches either a single, or a number of, species (at the stock or management unit level including as incidental catch) is managed under the harvest strategies established pursuant to this CMM.

Harvest Strategy Principles

4. ~~H~~The Commission agrees that hHarvest strategies are considered to represent a best-practice approach to fisheries management decision making. Harvest strategies are proactive, adaptive and provide a framework for taking the available information about a stock or fishery and applying an evidence and risk-based approach to setting harvest levels. They provide a more certain operating environment where management decisions relating to the stock or the fisheries for the stock, including bycatch, or are more consistent, predictable and transparent.
5. Harvest strategies developed in accordance with this CMM shall set out the management actions necessary to achieve defined biological, economic and/or social objectives in the stock~~fishery~~. Each harvest strategy shall contain a tailored process for ~~monitoring and~~ conducting assessments of the biological, economic and social conditions of the stock and, if appropriate, fishery and pre-defined rules that control the stock~~intensity of fishing activity according to the assessed conditions of the fishery.~~
6. In developing individual harvest strategies for stocks~~fisheries~~ within the Western and Central Pacific Ocean, the Commission shall have regard to the principles set out in the Convention, including Articles 5 and 6.

Elements of a harvest strategy

7. Each harvest strategy developed in accordance with this CMM ~~should~~shall, wherever possible, contain the following elements:
 - a. Defined operational objectives for the stock~~fishery~~ ('~~operational~~ management objectives')
 - ~~Indicators of fishery performance related to the objectives ('performance indicators')~~
 - b. Reference points for operational management objectives~~performance indicators~~ ('reference points')

- c. ~~A statement defining acceptable levels of risk to meeting the management objectives ('acceptable levels of risk')~~
~~A monitoring strategy to collect relevant data to assess fishery performance ('monitoring strategy')~~
- d. Decision rules that ensure reference points will not be exceeded and, in the event they are exceeded, restore the stocks~~control the intensity of fishing activity and/or catch~~ ('harvest control rules'), and
- e. An evaluation of the performance of the proposed harvest control rule~~harvest strategy~~ against management objectives, including risk assessment ('management strategy evaluation').

8. Further detail on each of these elements is set out in Annex 1 of this CMM.

9. Notwithstanding paragraphs 67 and 78 of this CMM, in developing individual harvest strategies, the Commission may tailor elements on a case by case basis to suit the specific requirements of a particular fishery. This may include agreeing to interim or provisional elements of a harvest strategy. The absence of ~~adequate~~appropriate scientific information shall not be used as a reason for postponing or failing to adopt harvest strategies.

10. In developing individual harvest strategies, the Commission shall take into account and apply Article 8 of the Convention, on compatibility of conservation and management measures on harvest strategies and elements thereof that have already been implemented in the region.

Special requirements of Developing States

11. In recognition of the special requirements of Developing States Parties to this Convention, in particular Small Island Developing States and of Territories and Possessions, in relation to conservation and management of highly migratory fish stocks in the Western and Central Pacific Ocean, the Commission will facilitate the effective participation of these States, Territories and Possessions in Commission meetings and those of its subsidiary bodies undertaking work on harvest strategies, and will apply the provisions of Article 30(2) of the Convention in the development of CMMs resulting from that work.

12. Harvest strategies shall not result in transferring, directly or indirectly, a disproportionate burden of conservation action onto developing States Parties, and territories and possessions.

Timelines for the adoption of harvest strategies ~~for specific fisheries~~

13. Harvest strategies for specific stocks~~fisheries~~ in the Western and Central Pacific Ocean shall be developed and adopted by the Commission in accordance with the indicative timeframes set out in Annex 2 of this CMM.

14. The Commission shall agree an initial timeframes to adopt harvest strategies, or at a minimum, stock-specific reference points and harvest control rules for the skipjack, bigeye, yellowfin, South Pacific albacore and Pacific bluefin and northern albacore¹~~tuna fisheries~~ by no later than the twelfth meeting of the Commission in 2015 and subject to review afterwards. The Commission may agree

¹ Draft timeframes and harvest strategies for stocks which occur mostly in the area north of 20° north parallel~~the Pacific bluefin tuna fishery and the northern albacore fishery~~ to be developed and recommended by the Northern Committee.

timeframes to adopt harvest strategies for other ~~stocks~~ fisheries. These agreed timeframes shall be incorporated into Annex 2 of this CMM.

Resources

~~14~~¹⁵. In formulating their budget and work programme, the Commission, Scientific Committee and any relevant WCPFC sub-committees are endeavored to~~shall~~ ensure that the tasks listed in this measure are sufficiently resourced in terms of time and budget to achieve the agreed timeframes.

~~15~~¹⁶. The Commission may draw on funds earmarked for this purpose from the Voluntary Contributions Fund to achieve the tasks listed in this measure.

~~16~~¹⁷. In the interests of efficiency and ensuring full participation by all CCMs, the Commission may decide to use existing WCPFC meetings to undertake the work set out in this CMM or convene additional workshops or meetings to consider the tasks set out in this CMM.

Annex 1

Additional detail on the elements of a harvest strategy and roles and responsibilities of the Commission and its subsidiary bodies

1. This Annex sets out further details on each of the elements to be developed for individual harvest strategies, wherever possible, and sets out the roles and responsibilities of the Commission and its subsidiary bodies.²

Management Objectives

2. For each harvest strategy, the Commission shall determine agreed conceptual management objectives for the stock fishery. In determining these objectives, the trade-offs between each objective, ~~as well as trade-offs between objectives for different fisheries~~ and harvest control rules ~~harvest strategies~~ shall be considered and any contradictions and tensions between competing objectives should be reconciled, where possible, in implementation of the harvest control rule to the extent possible.
3. The Scientific Committee and, where appropriate, other relevant subsidiary bodies shall translate these conceptual management objectives into objectives that have a direct and practical interpretation in the context of the fishery and against which performance can be evaluated ('operational management objectives'), if needed.

Performance indicators

- ~~4. The Scientific Committee shall recommend a set of specific performance indicators to measure progress against the agreed operational management objectives for each fishery. The indicators may be empirical (based on information produced by the fishery such as catch per unit effort) or model-based (including stock assessment outputs such as biomass or bioeconomic outputs such as economic rent).~~
- ~~5. In recommending appropriate indicators, the Scientific Committee may have regard to relevant international standards and guidelines, including the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations *Technical Guidelines for Responsible Fisheries: Indicators for Sustainable Fisheries Development of Marine Capture Fisheries* (FAO, 1999).~~

Reference points

- ~~6.4.~~ To achieve the agreed operational management objectives, the Commission shall, taking into account relevant advice from the Scientific Committee and other relevant subsidiary bodies, as appropriate, establish stock-specific reference points that identify:
 - i. Target intended to meet management objectives ~~targets to be achieved on average~~ ('target reference points'), and
 - ii. Limit intended to constrain harvesting with safe biological limits ~~limits to be avoided~~ ('limit reference points').

- ~~7.5.~~ Where the Commission has already adopted target or limit reference points for particular stocks, those

² ~~For fisheries based on stocks which occur mostly north of 20°N, the roles and responsibilities are to be separately agreed by the Commission (see paragraph 18 of this Annex).~~

agreed reference points shall be incorporated into the harvest strategy for that ~~stock~~fishery, unless the Commission decides otherwise.

Acceptable levels of risk

~~8.6.~~ Across all harvest strategies, the Commission shall define acceptable levels of risk associated with breaching limit reference points, and if appropriate, with deviating from target reference points, taking into account advice from the Scientific Committee and, where appropriate, other subsidiary bodies. In accordance with paragraph 3, Annex II of the UN Fish Stocks Agreement~~Article 6(1)(a) of the Convention~~, the Commission shall ensure that the risk of exceeding limit reference points is very low.

~~9.7.~~ Unless the Commission decides otherwise, target reference points shall be conservative and separated from limit reference points with an appropriate buffer, with a view to ensuring that the target reference points are not so close to the limit reference points that the chance that the limits are exceeded is greater than the agreed level of risk.

Monitoring strategy

~~The Commission shall ensure that for each fishery, sufficient data shall be collected and provided to the Commission within a suitable timeframe to assess the fishery's performance, and CCMs' compliance with relevant agreed management measures.~~

~~As part of an individual harvest strategy, the Commission may adopt a monitoring strategy for a fishery (where necessary data are not already required to be provided to the Secretariat) or rely on data required to be provided under existing CMMs and the Scientific Data to be Provided to the Commission standards.~~

~~10. For each fishery with an established harvest strategy, the Scientific Committee and other relevant subsidiary bodies, as appropriate, shall periodically evaluate the performance of the fishery against the agreed operational management objectives (as specified through the performance indicators and reference points). The Scientific Committee shall report its findings and advice to the Commission.~~

Harvest control rules

~~11.8.~~ For each fishery, the Commission shall decide on a set of clear, pre-agreed rules or actions used for determining a management action response to changes in indicators of stock status or other indicators, as appropriate, with respect to reference points ('harvest control rules').

~~In particular, individual harvest strategies shall be used to determine the overall level of exploitation and/or intensity of fishing for a fishery using a pre-agreed formula.~~

~~12.9.~~ Notwithstanding paragraph ~~10~~15 of this Annex, the Commission may decide to implement interim harvest control rules prior to a full management strategy evaluation being completed by the Scientific Committee.

Management strategy evaluation

~~13.10.~~ Prior to implementation of a formal harvest control rules~~harvest strategy~~, an evaluation of the likely performance of any proposed harvest control rule~~harvest strategy~~ in achieving the operational

objectives should be undertaken by the Scientific Committee and other relevant subsidiary bodies, as appropriate. These ~~management~~ ~~harvest~~ strategy evaluations may be performed through simulation modelling.

~~14.11.~~ As part of this process, the Scientific Committee and other relevant subsidiary bodies, as appropriate ~~will~~ ~~shall~~ estimate or describe key ~~management system~~ uncertainties including with respect to stock assessments and available data.

Fisheries based on stocks which occur mainly north of 20°N

~~15.12.~~ Notwithstanding paragraphs 1 to 1~~7~~ of this Annex, in developing harvest strategies for ~~fisheries based on~~ stocks which occur mostly in the area north of 20° north parallel ~~north of 20°N~~, the Northern Committee shall carry out its function in accordance with relevant provisions of the Convention and the Rules of Procedure ~~Commission shall separately agree the roles and responsibilities for developing each harvest strategy element.~~

Indicative initial timelines for adoption of harvest strategy CMMs11. South Pacific Albacore ~~fishery~~

Actions:	Agreement on management objectives	Identification and testing of candidate reference points Prepare progress report	Consider progress report from Scientific Committee Identify possible harvest control rules	Management strategy evaluation with implications of various targets on harvest control rules Provide advice on outcomes to Commission	Adoption of harvest strategy CMM (including all harvest strategy elements)
WCPFC Body responsible:	Commission	Scientific Committee	Commission	Scientific Committee	Commission
Time frame:-	By no later than WCPFC12 (2015)-	By no later than SC12 (2016)-	By no later than WCPFC13 (2016)-	By no later than SC13 (2017)-	By no later than WCPFC14 (2017)-

2. Skipjack ~~fishery~~

Actions:	Agreement on management objectives	Identification and testing of candidate reference points Prepare progress report	Consider progress report from Scientific Committee Identify possible harvest control rules	Management strategy evaluation with implications of various targets on harvest control rules Provide advice on outcomes to Commission	Adoption of harvest strategy CMM (including all harvest strategy elements)
-----------------	---	---	---	--	---

WCPFC Body responsible:	Commission	Scientific Committee	Commission	Scientific Committee	Commission
Timeframe:-	By no later than WCPFC12 (2015)-	By no later than SC12 (2016)-	By no later than WCPFC13 (2016)-	By no later than SC13 (2017)-	By no later than WCPFC14 (2017)-